



ANNUAL PROGRESS REPORT

**United Nations Development Programme
Kazakhstan**

**“Capacity Building for Innovation in Governance and
Digitalisation of Public Services”**

1 January - 31 December 2022



| | |
|--|--|
| Reporting Period | 1 January to 31 December 2022 |
| Donor | Government of Korea; UNDP Kazakhstan |
| Country | Kazakhstan |
| Project Title | Capacity Building for Innovation in Governance and Digitalisation of Public Services |
| Project ID (Atlas Award ID) Outputs | 00137296 Enhanced knowledge and capacity of public officials in the participating countries on the concept and practice of innovation in government and on digitalisation processes in public service delivery. |
| (Atlas Project ID and Description) | 00127858 The project aims to adapt and introduce good practices for Innovation in Governance and Digitalisation of Public Services through enhanced knowledge and capacity of public officials in the participating countries covering CA and the Caucasus. |
| Strategic Plan and/or CPD Outcomes | CPD Output 2.2: Institutions and systems enabled to develop and implement institutional reforms towards more effective, transparent, and inclusive governance and service provision at the national and local levels |
| Implementing Partner(s) | United Nations Development Programme |
| Project Start Date | 17 September 2021 |
| Project End Date | 31 December 2023 |
| [2022] Annual Work Plan Budget | [2022] USD 573,000 |
| Total resources required for 2022 | USD 573,000 |
| Revenue received (2021-2022) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Government of Korea USD 598, 520.79 • Total USD 598,520.79 |
| Unfunded budget | |
| UNDP Project Manager | Name: Bakyt Zhexembay Email: bakyt.zhexembay@undp.org Tel.: + 7 701 924 1071 |

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|----|
| I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY | 3 |
| II. BACKGROUND | 3 |
| III. PROGRESS REVIEW | 4 |
| IV. PROJECT RISKS AND ISSUES..... | 11 |
| A. UPDATED PROJECT RISKS AND ACTIONS..... | 11 |
| B. UPDATED PROJECT ISSUES AND ACTIONS | 11 |
| V. GENDER RELATED ACTIVITIES | 12 |
| VI. CROSS-CUTTING THEMES | 12 |
| VII. LESSONS LEARNED | 12 |
| VIII. CONCLUSIONS AND WAY FORWARD..... | 12 |
| IX. FINANCIAL STATUS | 14 |
| X. ANNEX | 16 |

I. Executive summary

The Project has implemented its outputs for this reporting period. It has concluded several capacity development activities for government officials and executives of central and local government administration and agencies, special bodies and institutions, experts, and policy makers in innovation policies and practices and in the provision of public services through differentiated channels of delivery, including digitally. Namely, the needs assessment study report (activity 1.1), the regional conference (activity 1.2), three capacity development workshops (activities 1.3 and 1.4), and a knowledge product on open government data (activity 1.6).¹ It has also completed a study visit to Korea (activity 2.1) aimed at exposing government officials to innovation practices of the Republic of Korea. 175 unique individuals were engaged in the Project activities during this reporting period, of which 110 were male (62.8%) and 65 women (37.2%).

As the pandemic began to wane away, no major implementation challenges were faced, as it was the case in 2021, and the project progressed according to its annual work plan and timeline of activities. Implementing the capacity development activities, the Project Team realised how important it is to start working on such activities as early as possible, since their planning and organisation requires sustained effort for a considerable period. The Project budget for this reporting period was **USD 573 000 of which USD 551 200,51** was utilised, and thus achieving a delivery rate of 96.2%.²

II. Background

This Project aspires to develop the capacities of civil servants to innovate in governance matters and for providing digitalised public services through differentiated channels of delivery, as well as to promote innovative practices. Its overall aim is to contribute towards improving the quality of life of citizens in the seven participating countries from Central Asia (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan), and from the Caucasus (Armenia, Azerbaijan, and Georgia). To address these objectives, the UNDP/ACSH and the Ministry of Interior and Safety (MOIS) and the National Information Society Agency (NIA) of the Republic of Korea have initiated this project to adopt good practices in governance and in public service provision through digital channels.

The expected result of this Project is enhanced knowledge of public officials in the participating countries on the concept and practice of innovation in government and on digitalisation processes in public service delivery, as well as enhanced capacity of public officials in the participating countries to introduce innovative practices and provide public services through a multitude of digital channels.

The context of the Project has not changed, and it remains rather relevant. The need for capacity building of civil servants on the dimensions and processes of the digital transformation is still high, as it was revealed through the findings of the needs assessment survey completed in the early part of 2022 and the assessment of the capacity development activities that took place during this reporting period.³

¹ Following discussions between the UNDP/ACSH and MOIS/NIA activities 1.5 and 1.6 were merged into one activity for the year 2022, given unforeseen budgetary constraints due to some activities costing more than budgeted and a reduced amount of the year's contribution due to a negative fluctuation exchange rate between the US\$ and the Korean WON.

² CDR 2022 as of January 2022. Numbers are subject to change after finalisation of the CRD 2022.

³ The sustained demand for capacity building of civil servants in digital transformation has prompted the UNDP/ACSH to submit a proposal for another such project of a 3-year duration with an expanded list of countries from Central Asia, the Caucasus, and Central and Eastern Europe.

III. Progress Review

| Expected outputs | Output indicators ⁴ | Data source | Baseline | | Value for the previous year if different from baseline | Target for the reported year | Actual value for the reported year |
|--|---|--|----------|------|--|------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| | | | Value | Year | | | |
| Output 1: Capacity building of government officials and executives of central and local government agencies, etc in innovation policy and practices and in digitalisation of public services | 1.1 Feasibility study completed identifying the essential areas, which the project activities will concentrate on during its implementation | Information collected from participating countries | 0 | 2020 | 1 | 0 | 0 |
| | 1.2 Number of government officials, executives, experts, etc, and policy makers from central and local government agencies attending the regional conference to discuss needs-assessment results and decide on topics for capacity development activities | Regional conference LoP / Event report | 0 | 2020 | | 60 | 60 |
| | 1.3 Number of government officials, executives, experts, and policy makers of central and local government agencies attending seminars introducing the concept of innovation and its potential uses in government and governance practices and in utilising differentiated channels of public service delivery through digitalisation, including the Korean experience | Seminars' LoP / Events' reports | 0 | 2020 | 327 | 50 | 82 |
| | 1.4 Number of government officials, executives, experts, and policy makers of central and local government agencies attending workshops to elaborate on policy design to create an environment conducive to innovative practices, as well as uses of innovative practices employed by the Republic of Korea | Workshops' LoP / Events' reports | 0 | 2020 | | 100 | 54 |

⁴ Indicator sequence numbers correspond to those in the Project Document.

| | | | | | | | |
|--|---|---------------------|---|------|--|---|---|
| | 1.5 Number of methodological guides produced on how to introduce innovative practices in government and on what steps to follow in digitalisation of public services | Publication records | 0 | 2020 | | 1 | 0 |
| | 1.6 Number of knowledge products prepared and published on methodologies to introduce innovation in government and/or case studies of successful implementation of innovation practices in government and introducing differentiated channels of public service delivery through digitalisation of public services | Publication records | 0 | 2020 | | 1 | 1 |

| Expected outputs | Output indicators | Data source | Baseline | | Value for the previous year if different from baseline | Target for the reported year | Actual value for the reported year |
|--|--|-------------------|----------|------|--|------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| | | | Value | Year | | | |
| Output 2: Government officials, executives of central and local government administration, etc are exposed to innovation practices through study visits to Korea | 2.1 Number of government officials, executives, experts, and policy makers of central and local government agencies, etc, exposed to innovation practices in governance and the provision of public services through differentiated channels of delivery through study tours to witness the Korean experience | Study visits' LoP | 0 | 2020 | | 20 | 20 |

The Project has two outputs. The first output includes the implementation of activities aimed at the capacity development of government officials and executives of central and local government administration and agencies, special bodies and institutions, experts and policy makers in digitalisation and innovation policy and practices in the provision of digital public services through differentiated channels of delivery and the operation of government entities.

The second involves a series of study visits of government personnel from the seven participating countries engaged in innovation and digitalisation policy design and implementation. The expected results from this project are enhanced knowledge of public officials and government personnel on the concepts and practices associated with digitalisation and innovation in government and on public services digitalisation processes and differentiated channels utilised for their delivery.

Output 1: Capacity building of government officials in innovation and digitalisation

For this reporting period, the first output includes several activities. Namely, further research and validation work associated with the needs-assessment study, the organisation of a regional conference to validate the findings of the needs-assessment study, three capacity building workshops / seminars, and the publication of a knowledge product.

1.1 Needs-assessment study: *Feasibility study to assess degree of readiness for introduction of innovative practices in government including provision of digitalised public services through differentiated channels of delivery.*

NUMBER OF NEEDS ASSESSMENT STUDIES – TARGET 1; ACCOMPLISHED 1

Following the conclusion of gathering and analysing the needs-assessment study findings,⁵ in 2021 the need arose for additional research to complement the findings of the study. Hence, a series of interviews were organised in six of the participating countries - except Uzbekistan - with government officials who provided additional information required, during the first two months of the current reporting period. The number of participants in the second round of gathering information is presented in the following table, by gender and country.

| | ARM | AZE | GEO | KAZ | KYR | TAJ | UZB | Total |
|---------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|
| Male | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | | 8 |
| Female | 1 | | | | 1 | | | 2 |
| Total | 3 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 1 | | 10 |

The final report of the study was completed at the end of February 2022. It was shared with the government entities and other organisations that are directly involved with digitalisation policy and implementation in the seven countries participating in this project for their comments and suggestions. Dissemination of the report had another purpose. That is to engage participants in contemplating the topics on which capacity development activities could concentrate on in the remaining part of 2022 and for 2023.

The needs-assessment study accomplished its objectives, as it managed to gather the needs of the participating countries in introducing innovation in government operations and policy implementation and in providing digital public services utilising differentiated channels of delivery and produce a list of topics for capacity development initiatives.

Moreover, drawing on the findings of the feasibility study, the ACSH Research team developed a paper titled "Digitalisation of Public Service Delivery, and Innovation in Government Operations in Central Asia and the Caucasus", which was published in the International Journal of Civil Service Reform and Practice in September of 2022.⁶

⁵ Designed to assess the degree of readiness of each country for digitalisation transformation and public service delivery utilising easy-to-use and convenient differentiated channels for their delivery

⁶ <https://www.astanahubjournal.org/index.php/ijcsrp/article/view/159>

1.2 Regional Conference: *Regional conference to discuss findings of the feasibility study and decide on the topics the project will focus on.*

NUMBER OF REGIONAL CONFERENCES HELD – TARGET 1; ACCOMPLISHED 1

NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS – TARGET 60; ACTUAL 50

The regional conference aimed at discussing the findings of the needs-assessment study took place in Astana, Kazakhstan on 14 April 2022.⁷ The findings of the needs-assessment study findings were presented, followed by discussion through which the participants confirmed the scope and content of the capacity development activities for 2022 and 2023.⁸

The number of direct beneficiaries from the seven participating countries was 50 individuals of which 17 were women (34%) and 33 male (66%).

| | ARM | AZE | GEO | KAZ | KYR | TAJ | UZB | Total |
|---------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|
| Male | 2 | 4 | 3 | 15 | 1 | 3 | 5 | 33 |
| Female | 1 | 1 | 2 | 8 | 3 | 2 | | 17 |
| Total | 3 | 5 | 5 | 23 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 50 |

The main topics that emerged from this discussion indicated the areas on which envisioned capacity development activities would focus on. The topics may be divided into two groups, from more general to more specific, the following:

| | |
|---------|---|
| Group 1 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Whole of government approaches for digitalisation – Digital government policy frameworks – Open data policy frameworks and practices – Citizen feedback platforms – Change management training programmes for top-level decision makers to fully comprehend digitalisation transformation processes |
| Group 2 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Universal design processes; analysis of services to be digitalised – Integration of independently developed e-services and consolidation of core databases; interoperability modalities – Information and cybersecurity modalities and systems – Digital payment systems for obtaining public services |

Overall, the outcome of the regional conference was to validate the topics which representatives of the participating countries would like to focus on, as well as to discuss the proposed topics for the development methodological guides and knowledge products during 2022 and 2023.

1.3 Seminars [Workshops]: *To introduce the concept of innovation and its potential uses in government and governance practices and utilising differentiated channels of public service delivery through digitalisation – including mainly the Korean experience.*

NUMBER OF SEMINARS HELD – TARGET 1; ACCOMPLISHED 2

NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS – TARGET 50; ACTUAL 82

1.3.1 Seminar / Workshop on digital policy frameworks

This capacity building activity took place on 25-26 October 2022 in Samarkand, Uzbekistan. The event focused on disseminating knowledge and experiences on policy frameworks for digital governance, as the adoption of such a framework can create a more conducive

⁷ Postponed in 2021 due to the pandemic-induced travel restrictions.

⁸ The regional conference was complemented by a capacity development activity, organised by the National Info-communications Holding "ZERDE" JSC on 15 April 2022, titled "Transformation in Action: Digital Partnership to Enhance Technological Leadership". This event brought together the regional conference participants along with practitioners and experts from Korea and the USA in the field of info-communication technologies, IT infrastructure, software, and IT services to discuss cooperation in big data analytics, and for the development of digital transformation.

environment for the digital transformation process and thus help participating countries to make the transition from e-government to digital governance. The knowledge and expertise of the OECDs Open and Innovative Government Division (OIG) of the OECD Directorate for Public Governance (GOV) was utilised for the purpose, as well as an array of Korean experts who shared information on the digital government framework – its achievements and progress – in the Republic of Korea.⁹

The number of direct beneficiaries from the seven participating countries was 36, including 32 male (88.9%) and 4 women (11.1%).

| | ARM | AZE | GEO | KAZ | KYR | TAJ | UZB | Total |
|---------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|
| Male | 2 | 3 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 20 | 32 |
| Female | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 4 |
| Total | 3 | 3 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 2 | 20 | 36 |

The workshop accomplished its objectives as it managed to disseminate information, knowledge, and experience of the OECD digital government policy framework and its dimensions that are critical in designing and implementation a digital transformation programme. A considerable number of high-level officials from the seven participating countries attended the workshop and they also took part in an exercise that aimed at identifying the most important dimensions of the digital government policy framework in each country.

1.3.2 Seminar / Workshop on Open Data Policies, Practices, and Cases

This capacity building activity took place on 1-2 December 2022 in Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan and focused on open data policies, practices and cases highlighting the experiences of Canada, Estonia, the European Union, and the Republic of Korea on the topic. By utilising the knowledge and expertise of a seasoned consultancy firm it disseminated information on the various components and aspects that are critical to developing articulate open data policies and practices and public sector information spaces along with country examples. Korean experts added the Korean experience on open data policy and its practical manifestation for the benefit of citizens and business in the country.¹⁰

The number of direct beneficiaries from the seven participating countries was 46, including 23 male (50%) and 23 women (50%).

| | ARM | AZE | GEO | KAZ | KYR | TAJ | UZB | Total |
|---------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|
| Male | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 13 | 2 | 3 | 23 |
| Female | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 17 | 1 | 0 | 23 |
| Total | 3 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 30 | 3 | 3 | 46 |

The seminar accomplished its objectives as it allowed its participants to be exposed to open government data policies and practices around the world and draw comparisons with the own policies and practices currently in place.

1.4 Workshops [Seminars]: *To present and elaborate on policy design to create an environment conducive to innovation practices, as well as uses of innovative practices by the Government of the Republic of Korea.*

⁹ The workshop was complemented – on the second day – by presentations of the E-Government Index including the findings for the participating countries and regional trends, as well as of the Estonian Digital Transformation experience; and a visit to the ICTEXPO International IT Exhibition.

¹⁰ The workshop was complemented - on the second day – with fact-finding missions, organised by the Ministry of Digital Development of the Kyrgyz Republic, to the Entrepreneurs Service Centre of the State Tax Service on the digitalisation of tax administration, to the Situation Centre of the State Customs Service on digitalisation of customs administration, and the Kyrgyz Software and Service Development Association. The day was concluded with a visit to the High-Technology Park of the Kyrgyz Republic.

NUMBER OF WORKSHOPS HELD – TARGET 1; ACCOMPLISHED 1NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS – TARGET 100; ACTUAL 54**1.4.1 Workshop / Seminar on whole of government approaches to digitalisation**

This capacity building activity based on the findings of the needs-assessment study and the ensuing prioritisation of topics by the regional conference participants took place on 20-21 June, in Tbilisi, Georgia and focused on whole of government approaches to digitalisation. This workshop was part of an international meeting titled "Cooperation and Capacity Development in Digital Government" comprising two activities (a) presentations of Korean and Georgian digital government case studies, and (b) workshop on whole of government approaches to digitalisation. The case studies showcased the developments in digital government by representatives of the Ministry of Justice of Georgia and the Ministry of the Interior and Safety and other related government agencies of the Republic of Korea. The seminar elaborated in depth the whole of government approaches to digitalisation utilising the knowledge and expertise of the World Bank's Governance Global Practice GOV TECH team.¹¹

The number of direct beneficiaries from the seven participating countries was 54, including 29 male (53.7%) and 25 women (46.3%).

| | ARM | AZE | GEO | KAZ | KYR | TAJ | UZB | Total |
|---------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|
| Male | 2 | 3 | 13 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 29 |
| Female | 1 | | 21 | 1 | 1 | 1 | | 25 |
| Total | 3 | 3 | 34 | 5 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 54 |

The workshop's objectives were met, as participants of the workshop, high officials on digitalisation issues from the seven participating countries, were exposed to successful practices and solutions in adopting whole of government approaches to designing, planning, and implementing their digitalisation initiatives. It also initiated a vigorous exchange of knowledge and experience among the participants and the World Bank Gov Tech team on whole of government approaches to digitalisation implementation challenges and issues.

1.5 Production and distribution of methodological guides: on how to introduce innovative practices in government and on what steps to follow in digitalising public service for delivery through differentiated channels.

NUMBER OF METHODOLOGICAL GUIDES PREPARED AND PUBLISHED – TARGET 1; ACCOMPLISHED 0

No methodological guide was produced during the reporting period, as it was mutually agreed between **the two parties involved** – UNDP/ACSH and the MOIS/NIA - in project implementation not to proceed with this activity because of budgetary constraints (unanticipated increases in the cost of workshops and seminars implementation, and a reduction in available funds in US\$ due to a negative exchange rate fluctuation between the Korean Won and the US\$).

1.6 Publication of knowledge products: on methodologies to introduce innovation in government and case studies of successful implementation of innovation in government and in introducing differentiated channels of delivery for public services.

NUMBER OF KNOWLEDGE PRODUCTS PREPARED AND PUBLISHED – TARGET 1; ACCOMPLISHED 1**1.6.1 Knowledge Product on Open Government Data development and publication**

The last activity under output 1 involved the preparation of a knowledge product and its publication among the participating countries of this project, as well as among the Astana Civil Service Hub participating countries and beyond.

¹¹ The workshop was complemented by a field visit organised by the Digital Governance Agency and the Public Service Delivery Development Agency of the Republic of Georgia the next day to the Techno Park and a Public Service Hall. The two Agencies also presented the Georgian experience on digitalisation, prior to the tour of the Techno Park and the Public Service Hall.

This publication focused on open government data policies and practices – including good practices implemented across the world that could be adopted to other national and local contexts - in some leading countries in the world, i.e., Canada, Estonia, and Korea, as well as the current open government data policies and practices in the seven participating countries. The publication discusses and elaborates on such concepts as access to information, public information space, Big Data, open data, accompanied by an overview of actual policies and practices. In this context, the publication has accomplished the goal it was intended for, that is to provide useful and current information on a topic related to digital transformation.

Output 2: Exposure of government officials to innovation and digitalisation practices

For this reporting period, the second output includes one activity. The visit to Korea of representatives from the seven participating countries to observe current practices in innovation and digitalisation of public services in the Republic of Korea.

2.1. Study Visits to Korea: *Training programmes organised for a selective group of government officials and executives of central and local government administration, special bodies and institutions, experts, and policy makers.*

NUMBER OF STUDY VISITS – TARGET 1; ACCOMPLISHED 1

NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS – TARGET 20; ACTUAL 20

A study visit to the Republic of Korea was organised for representatives of the seven participating countries between 19 and 21 September to observe first-hand “public service delivery utilising state-of-the-art digital technologies”. The study visit provided an opportunity for participants to familiarise themselves with Korea’s knowledge and experience in public service innovation and emerging technologies, and to identify ways and means that may also be applicable for the project’s participating countries.

The study visit consisted of a seminar and site visits to relevant institutions. The seminar focused on laws, governance, and policies of emerging technologies like Big Data, e-Cloud, and AI. The site visits included the Digital Government Exhibition Hall, the Korean Minting, Security Printing and ID Card Operating Corporation, the National Information Resource Service, the Anyang Smart City Centre, and the SAMSUNG SDS.

The number of direct beneficiaries from the seven participating countries was 20, including 15 male (75%) and 5 women (25%).

□

| | ARM | AZE | GEO | KAZ | KYR | TAJ | UZB | Total |
|---------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|
| Male | 2 | 3 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 3 | 15 |
| Female | 1 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 5 |
| Total | 3 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 20 |

.....

The Project has contributed to UNSDCF Outcome 2 by elevating the capacity of state institutions to design and implement evidence-based public policies and provide quality services in an inclusive, transparent, and accountable manner. Its capacity activities focus on providing knowledge, experience, and expertise to state institutions to better their policy making capacity and improve the quality of public service provision and delivery. Efforts to achieve the intended outcome level results seem to be on track.

The Project has also contributed to CPD Output 2.2 as the improved knowledge acquired through knowledge exchange and experience capacity development activities of high-level officials and civil servants from the seven participating countries, as well as from its publication are on track according to the project’s targets for this reporting period.

Overall, the total number of unique individuals who have benefited from the project activities during 2022 were 175, of which 110 were male (62.8%) and 65 women (37.2%). Georgian,

Kazakhstani, Kyrgyz, and Uzbek participants are comparatively more than those of Armenia, Azerbaijan, and Tajikistan, because these four countries hosted project activities. Consequently, many more of their public servants had the opportunity to participate in the capacity development activity that took place in their country.

| | ARM | AZE | GEO | KAZ | KYR | TAJ | UZB | Total |
|---------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|
| Male | 7 | 12 | 15 | 24 | 18 | 7 | 27 | 110 |
| Female | 4 | 2 | 23 | 11 | 21 | 4 | 0 | 65 |
| Total | 11 | 14 | 38 | 35 | 39 | 11 | 27 | 175 |

IV. Project Risks and Issues

a. Updated project risks and actions

Project Risk 1: Participating countries lose interest in the project activities due to irrelevance

Actions taken: A needs-assessment survey was conducted as the first activity of the project to find out what the most relevant topics are for the participating countries and a list of topics of interest was drawn up following the conclusion of the regional conference that took place on 14 April 2022. As a result, findings of the needs-assessment study, confirmed by the regional conference participants, currently serve as the guideline for the themes of the capacity development initiatives.

Project Risk 2: Pandemic crisis effect on the Project

Actions taken: In some of the participating countries there is still a restricted travel regime in effect, which complicates implementation of project activities in person. Thus, some activities that can be implemented on-line, are implemented remotely to compensate for lack of mobility of prospective participants and project staff.

Project Risk 3: Quality of results achieved are insufficient to meet the project objectives

Actions taken: Implementation of a series of capacity development initiatives have initiated participants in the concepts related to digitalisation using the Korean experience, and expertise of relevant international organisations that share knowledge on such topics and good practices from countries that have succeeded. Such activities have improved understanding of how to proceed with digital transformation.

b. Updated project issues and actions

Project Issue 1: Reduced budget for 2022 and 2023

Actions taken: As the budget of the project was reduced, due to the unfavourable exchange rate between the Korean Won and the US\$, the project has adjusted its activities for 2022 and 2023 respectively. It has merged activities 1.5 and 1.6 under output 1 and it has produced one knowledge product but no methodological guide. Similarly, in 2023 will produce one methodological guide but no knowledge product.

Project Issue 2: Frequent change of Korean officials overseeing the Project

Actions taken: The project staff documents every activity thoroughly and it prepares detailed progress reports every six months (mid-year and annual) to facilitate understanding of the context and progress of activities of the project, when new officials assume their oversight and coordination role. The project staff is also in constant communication and consultation with officials from MOIS and NIA informing them and discussing with them all important and crucial aspects with respect to the project implementation.

Project Issue 3: Animosity among some of the participating countries

Actions taken: Although it is explicitly understood that capacity development activities are implemented in every participating country on a rotating basis, a conscious choice has been made to skip those countries that may bar participation of officials from another participating country. Furthermore, in the eventuality that an activity must take place at a certain location, then some participants join remotely, as they cannot attend in person.

V. Gender Related Activities

The project ensures gender balance among the participants of its learning and training activities. Furthermore, gender aspects are taken into consideration for all its capacity development, research-related and partnership events. 37.2% of the project beneficiaries are women (65 out of 175 unique beneficiaries). Equal gender representation could not be achieved, as participating countries' representatives in high-level positions in the relevant government organisations are predominantly men, thus tipping the gender balance considerably. This is obviously due to external factors and actors, and it is beyond the control of the project to alleviate gender representation imbalances among the direct beneficiaries of the project. However, an effort was made to have gender balance among the personnel involved in the implementation of the project. In fact, women outweighed men by two to one, i.e., 66% women and 34% men.

VI. Cross-Cutting Themes

This project's activities fall under the Triangular Cooperation schema, as they involve a leading country in digitalisation, as a donor and a knowledge and expertise provider, and several other countries that are also cooperating with one another, in various fields of civil service and public administration reform, including digital transformation.

VII. Lessons Learned

Through a well-established and seamless cooperation with the project partners, and a well-coordinated teamwork, the project objectives were achieved in 2022. Prompt identification of the countries' needs in the very early part of the year – a result of the needs assessment study and its findings – the project managed to deliver three capacity development activities and produce a knowledge product that were relevant to the project objectives as well as very congruent to the participating countries priorities in their digital transformation process.

A difficulty that the project faces is that due to budget constraints the project cannot plan capacity development activities that extend beyond two days duration. For instance, it seems that some topics of interest on digitalisation would be dealt better and, in more detail, if it was possible to implement workshops that could last for up to 3 workdays.

Programming could be further improved if lead times between the decision to conduct a capacity development activity and its actual implementation are at least 90-100 days long. The project team is working on this, by providing lists of proposed activities, their venues and time as early as possible so that decisions on implementation can be made as early as possible.

VIII. Conclusions and Way Forward

The project is on track in achieving its output targets, as well as its intended outcomes. Considerable effort is made by the project implementation team to plan and organise expected activities in an efficient and timely manner. By doing this, the project implementation team has adopted an agile approach and sufficient flexibility to quickly adapt to outside changes, to ensure that its deliverables remain at the highest quality possible.

The excellent project performance to date provided the opportunity to submit another project proposal for the period 2024-2026 worth USD 1.5 million, upon invitation by the donor of the current project. The ACSH team prepared and submitted such a proposal in September 2022, and it anticipates the decision to be announced sometime in the course of 2023.

IX. Financial Status

Expenditure report (2021-2022)

| Activity | Approved budget 2021-2023 ¹² | 2021 expenses | | 2022 expenses | | 2021-2022 Total expenses | |
|--------------------------------|---|--|-----------|--|------------|--|------------|
| Activity 1 - Capacity building | 485 148,52 | 64397 - Services to projects -CO staff | 219,30 | 64397 - Services to projects -CO staff | 7 016,93 | 64397 - Services to projects -CO staff | 7 236,23 |
| | | 71405 - Service Contracts-Individuals | 10 004,07 | 71305 - Local Consult. -Sht Term-Tech | 13 801,87 | 71305 - Local Consult.-Sht Term-Tech | 13 801,87 |
| | | 71410 -MAIP Premium SC | 4,20 | 71415 - Contribution to Security SC | 1 063,79 | 71405 - Service Contracts-Individuals | 10 004,07 |
| | | 71415 - Contribution to Security SC | 250,00 | 71460 - Int Personnel Srvc Agreement | 60 751,93 | 71410 -MAIP Premium SC | 4,2 |
| | | 71460 - Int Personnel Srvc Agreement | 22 121,16 | 71470 - Natl Personnel Srvc Agreement | 40 204,45 | 71415 - Contribution to Security SC | 1 313,79 |
| | | 72120 - Svc Co-Trade and Business Serv | 210,53 | 71505 - UN Volunteers-Stipend & Allow | 2 800,90 | 71460 - Int Personnel Srvc Agreement | 82 873,09 |
| | | 72145 - Svc Co-Training and Educ Serv | 4 564,95 | 71520 - UNV_Volunteer_Learning | 97,57 | 71470 - Natl Personnel Srvc Agreement | 40 204,45 |
| | | 74220 - Translation Costs | 4 801,23 | 71535 - UNV-Medical Insurance | 292,66 | 71505 - UN Volunteers-Stipend & Allow | 2 800,9 |
| | | 74510 - Bank Charges | 2,31 | 71540 - UNV-Global Charges | 136,05 | 71520 - UNV_Volunteer_Learning | 97,57 |
| | | 74596 - Services to projects | 94,01 | 71541 - UNVs-Contribution to security | 84,12 | 71535 - UNV-Medical Insurance | 292,66 |
| | | 75105 - Facilities & Admin - Implement | 3 381,73 | 71550 - UNV RSA / Exit Allowance | 233,50 | 71540 - UNV-Global Charges | 136,05 |
| | | 76135 - Realized Gain | -11,61 | 71592 - UNV_COST_RECOVERY_RECU | 462,05 | 71541 - UNVs-Contribution to security | 84,12 |
| | | | | 71605 - Travel Tickets-International | 111 804,35 | 71550 - UNV RSA / Exit Allowance | 233,5 |
| | | | | 71615 - Daily Subsistence Allow-Intl | 20 240,96 | 71592 - UNV_COST_RECOVERY_RECU | 462,05 |
| | | | | 71635 - Travel - Other | 7 990,00 | 71605 - Travel Tickets-International | 111 804,35 |
| | | | | 72120 - Svc Co-Trade and Business Serv | 47 758,10 | 71615 - Daily Subsistence Allow-Intl | 20 240,96 |
| | | | | 72145 - Svc Co-Training and Educ Serv | 2 469,80 | 71635 - Travel - Other | 7990 |
| | | | | 74205 - Audio Visual Productions | 2 255,48 | 72120 - Svc Co-Trade and Business Serv | 47 968,63 |
| | | | | 74220 - Translation Costs | 16 090,86 | 72145 - Svc Co-Training and Educ Serv | 7 034,75 |
| | | | | 74225 - Other Media Costs | 112,25 | 74205 - Audio Visual Productions | 2 255,48 |
| | | | | 74230 - Audio & Visual Equipment | 1116,02 | 74220 - Translation Costs | 20 892,09 |
| | | | | 74510 - Bank Charges | 581,67 | 74225 - Other Media Costs | 112,25 |
| | | | | 74596 - Services to projects -GOE | 3 007,17 | 74230 - Audio & Visual Equipment | 1 116,02 |
| | | | | 74599 - UNDP cost recovery chrgs-Bills | 168,39 | 74510 - Bank Charges | 583,98 |
| | | | | 75105 - Facilities & Admin - Implement | 32 273,76 | 74596 - Services to projects | 3101,18 |
| | | | | 75705 - Learning costs | 62 880,96 | 74599 - UNDP cost recovery chrgs-Bills | 168,39 |
| | | | | 76125 - Realized Loss | 537,74 | 75105 - Facilities & Admin - Implement | 35 655,49 |
| | | | | 76135 - Realized Gain | 221,80 | 75705 - Learning costs | 62 880,96 |
| | | | | | | 76125 - Realized Loss | 537,74 |
| | | | | | | 76135 - Realized Gain | -233,41 |

¹² As per Amendment 1 to Grant Arrangement agreement between UNDP and the Ministry of the Interior and Safety of the Republic of Korea.

| Total Activity 1 | | 45 641,88 | 436 011,53 | 481 653,41 | | | |
|--------------------------|-------------------|--|-------------------|--|-----------|--|-----------|
| Activity 2 -Study Visits | 404 834,65 | 64397 - Services to projects -CO staff | 54,62 | 64397 - Services to projects -CO staff | 150,80 | 64397 - Services to projects -CO staff | 205,42 |
| | | 71405 - Service Contracts-Individuals | 147,56 | 71605 - Travel Tickets-International | 34 008,52 | 71405 - Service Contracts-Individuals | 147,56 |
| | | 74220 - Translation Costs | 2329,42 | 71615 - Daily Subsistence Allow-Intl | 27 609,18 | 71605 - Travel Tickets-International | 34 008,52 |
| | | 74510 - Bank Charges | 1,14 | 71635 - Travel - Other | 4 700,00 | 71615 - Daily Subsistence Allow-Intl | 27 609,18 |
| | | 74596 - Services to projects -GOE | 23,42 | 72120 - Svc Co-Trade and Business Serv | 4 888,00 | 71635 - Travel - Other | 4700 |
| | | 75105 - Facilities & Admin - Implement | 204,49 | 72130 - Svc Co-Transportation Services | 1 893,39 | 72120 - Svc Co-Trade and Business Serv | 4888 |
| | | | | 72145 - Svc Co-Training and Educ Serv | 2 486,00 | 72130 - Svc Co-Transportation Services | 1 893,39 |
| | | | | 74220 - Translation Costs | 8 600,00 | 72145 - Svc Co-Training and Educ Serv | 2486 |
| | | | | 74510 - Bank Charges | 307,83 | 74220 - Translation Costs | 10 929,42 |
| | | | | 74596 - Services to projects -GOE | 64,60 | 74510 - Bank Charges | 308,97 |
| | | 75105 - Facilities & Admin - Implement | 6 776,66 | 74596 - Services to projects -GOE | 88,02 | | |
| | | | | 75105 - Facilities & Admin - Implement | 6981,15 | | |
| Total Activity 2 | | 2 760,65 | 91 484,98 | 94 245,63 | | | |
| Grand Total | 889 983,17 | 48 402,53 | 527 496,51 | 575 899,04 | | | |

Bakyt Zhexembay
Project Manager, ACSH/UNDP

DocuSigned by:

 124A76605AFF44D

20-Feb-2023

X. Annexes

Annex 1, Annual Work Plan (AWP) 2022



AWP revised MOIS
2022.pdf



Cover page AWP
2022_00127858_revi:

Annex 2, CDR 2022



CDR_2022_0012785
8.pdf

Annex 3, Relevant copies of media coverage

[Best Practices in open data policy frameworks and successful cases were presented by International Experts of the Republic of Korea and KPMG Baltics to Civil Servants of Central Asia and the Caucasus \(astanacivilservicehub.org\)](#)

[Best Practices in the Development of Digital Government Policy were Presented by International Experts of the OECD to Civil Servants of Central Asia and the Caucasus \(astanacivilservicehub.org\)](#)

[Government Representatives of Central Asia and the Caucasus countries have learned leading practices of the Republic of Korea in the field of Digitalization of Public Service Delivery \(astanacivilservicehub.org\)](#)

[Civil servants of Central Asia and the Caucasus familiarized with the best practices in the field of digital government \(astanacivilservicehub.org\)](#)

[The ACSH and the Ministry of the Interior and Safety of the Republic of Korea discussed prospects for expanding cooperation \(astanacivilservicehub.org\)](#)

[The first study to identify the digital transformation needs of countries in the region was presented within the joint project of the Government of the Republic of Korea \(astanacivilservicehub.org\)](#)

[20220523 Feasibility Study Report final.pdf \(astanacivilservicehub.org\)](#)