Socioeconomic Development Through Demining and Increasing the Border Surveillance Capacity at the Eastern Borders of Turkey-Phase II



TR2012/0124.04/001

#### **FINAL NARRATIVE REPORT**

Reporting Period: 19.12.2015 - 18.12.2019

#### June 2020

United Nations Development Programme Turkey



This project is funded by the European Union and implemented by the United Nations Development Programme. The beneficiaries of the project are the Ministry of National Defence, Turkish Mine Action Centre and the Ministry of Interior, Border Management, Foreign Relations and Projects Department. The Central Finance and Contracts Unit is the Contracting Authority of this Project.













#### **CONTENTS**

1.	DESCRIPTION	6
1.1.	Name of Coordinator of the grant contract:	
1.2.	Name and title of the Contact Person: 6	
1.3.	Name of Beneficiary(ies) and affiliated entity(ies) in the Action:6	
1.4.	Title of the Action:6	
1.5.	Contract number:6	
1.6.	Start date and end date of the Action:6	
1.7.	Target country(ies) or region(s):6	
1.8.	Final beneficiaries and target groups:6	
1.9. <b>2.</b>	Country(ies) in which the activities take place (if different from 1.7):7 <b>ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION OF ACTIVITIES OF THE ACTION</b>	
2.1.	Results and Activities8	
	2.1.1. Result 1: Demining the border regions of Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) is completed	
	Activity 1.1: Survey of mined areas	
	Activity 1.2: Procurement of mine clearance services	9
	Activity 1.3: Mobilization, training and accreditation of mine clearance service provider	9
	Activity 1.4: Clearance of specified mined areas	9
	Activity 1.5: Final completion and handover of cleared areas	
	Activity 1.6: Demobilisation	10
	2.1.2. Result 2: Demined areas are certified in compliance with the international and Turkish mine action standards	
	Activity 2.1: Procurement of QA/QC services	10
	Activity 2.2: Mobilization and accreditation of QA/QC provider	10
	Activity 2.3: Accreditation of the mine clearance service provider	10
	Activity 2.4: QA/QC of mine clearance operations	11
	Activity 2.5: Final completion and handover of cleared areas	11
	2.1.3. Result 3: Post Project Review is conducted	11
	Activity 3.1: Lessons learned log maintained throughout duration of project	11
	Activity 3.2: Post project review workshop conducted	11
	Activity 3.3: Project closure event	12
	2.1.4. Result 4 - Institutional capacity on border management is enhanced	12
	Activity 4.1 Capacity development for TURMAC	12
	Activity 4.1.1: Needs assessment of the national mine action programme	12
	Activity 4.1.2: Review of the national mine action strategy	13
	Activity 4.1.3: Development of national standards	14
	Activity 4.1.4: Development of guidelines on Land Release	14

	Activity 4.1.5: Review of the mine clearance completion plan	. 15
	Activity 4.1.6: Develop and deliver tailored training activities	. 15
	Activity 4.2: Strengthened Risk analysis System on Integrated Border Management	16
	Activity 4.2.1: Review of the legal dimension of border security in the EU	. 16
	Activity 4.2.2: Comparative review of risk analysis-based border management	. 17
	Activity 4.2.3: Develop updated risk management model for border management	. 18
	Activity 4.2.4: Comparative analysis of procedural requirements addressing illegal movements at the border regions	. 19
	Activity 4.2.5: Development and delivery of tailor-made training modules for the professional staff at borders	. 20
	Activity 4.2.6: Development and delivery of Training of Trainers (ToT) programme	20
2.2.	Assessment of Results	
2.3.	Contracts (other than mine clearance and QA/QC service provider contracts) 24 2.3.1. Senior/Junior International/Local Short-Term Experts	. 24
	2.3.2. Long-Term Agreements	. 25
2.4.	Sustainability	
2.5.	Monitoring and Evaluation	
2.6.	Logical Framework	
2.7.	Action Plan27	
2.8. <b>3.</b>	Budget	. 28
3.1.	Relations with the Beneficiaries	
3.2.	Continuation of Partnership	
3.3.	Relations with other Government Authorities	
3.4.	Relations with other Organizations/Contractors	
3.5.	Links and synergies with other Actions	
3.6.	Links with previous EU Grants29	
3.7.	Cooperation with the Contracting Authority	30

#### **ANNEXES**

- A. Report on Non-technical Survey of Minefields (Available electronically in the package)
- B. 2019 Accreditation Document for Teams, MDDs and Equipment (Available electronically in the package)
- C. Eastern Border Mine Clearance Project Operational Demining Process (Available electronically in the package)
- D. Post Project Report of Clearance Contractor (Available electronically in the package)
- E. Sample of QA Evaluation Monitoring for Demining Operations (Available electronically in the package)
- F. Final Report of QA/QC Service Provider (Available electronically in the package)
- G. Lessons Learned Log (Available electronically in the package)
- H. LL Workshop Minutes and Post Project Review Report (Available electronically in the package)
- I. Capacity Assessment Report under Activity 4.1.1 (Available electronically in the package)
- J. Reports under Activity 4.1.2 (Available electronically in the package)
- K. Reports under Activity 4.1.3 (Available electronically in the package)
- L. Draft National Land Release Policy and Workshop under Activity 4.1.4 (Available electronically in the package)
- M. Turkey's APMBC Article 7 Report in English under Activity 4.1.5 (Available electronically in the package)
- N. Reports under Activity 4.1.6 (Available electronically in the package)
- O. The Comparative Analysis Report on the Legislative Framework of Border Security under Activity 4.2.1 (Available electronically in the package)
- P. The Comparative Review of Risk Analysis-Based Border Management Report under Activity 4.2.2 (Available electronically in the package)
- Q. The Updated Tailor-Made Risk Management Model for Border Management in Turkey Report under Activity 4.2.3 (Available electronically in the package)
- R. The Comparative Analysis Report on Procedural Requirements under Activity 4.2.4 (Available electronically in the package)
- S. Training Report and Tailor-Made Training Modules under Activity 4.2.5 and 4.2.6 (Available electronically in the package)
- T. Final Budget as of 18 December 2019 (Available electronically in the package)
- U. Samples of Visibility Documents (Available electronically in the package)
- V. Log Frame Results (Available electronically in the package)
- W. Minutes of 13th Steering Committee Meeting and Transfer of Title of Assets Document with attached Transferred Asset List (Available electronically in the package)
- X. Final Action Plan (Available electronically in the package)

**June 2020** Page 4 of 31

## LIST OF ACRONYMS

Anti-Personnel Mine Ban Convention (Ottawa Convention) **APMBC** 

**CDS** Capacity Development Specialist

**CCM** Convention on Cluster Munitions

**CTA** Chief Technical Advisor

DoA Description of the Action

**EBCGA** European Border and Coast Guard Agency

**EBMCP** Eastern Border Mine Clearance Project

**EBMCS** Eastern Border Mine Clearance Standards

EU The European Union

**EUD** Delegation of the European Union to Turkey

**GICHD** Geneva International Centre for Humanitarian Demining

**IBM Integrated Border Management** 

**ICMPD** International Centre for Migration Policy Development

Information Management System for Mine Action **IMSMA** 

**MDD** Mine Detection Dog

**MFA** Ministry of Foreign Affair

MoI Ministry of Interior

**MoND** Ministry of National Defence

**NACORAC** National Coordination and Joint Risk Analysis Centre

National Mine Action Standards **NMAS** 

**ODP Operational Demining Procedures** 

**OWG** Operational Working Group

PM Project Manager

QA/QC Quality Assurance / Quality Control

**SOP** Standard Operating Procedure

Technical Assistance Team TAT

**TGS** Turkish General Staff

**TURMAC** Turkish Mine Action Centre

**UNDP** United Nations Development Programme

Page 5 of 31 Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the

#### 1. DESCRIPTION

## 1.1. Name of Coordinator of the grant contract:

Mr. Claudio Tomasi, Resident Representative, UNDP Turkey

#### 1.2. Name and title of the Contact Person:

Mr. Claudio Tomasi, Resident Representative, UNDP Turkey

# 1.3. Name of Beneficiary(ies) and affiliated entity(ies) in the Action:

Ministry of National Defence (Turkish Mine Action Centre - TURMAC),

Ministry of Interior (General Directorate of Provincial Administrations, Border Management Foreign Relations and Projects Department.

#### 1.4. Title of the Action:

Socioeconomic Development Through Demining and Increasing the Border Surveillance Capacity at the Eastern Borders of Turkey-Phase II

# 1.5. Contract number:

TR2012/0124.04/001

#### 1.6. Start date and end date of the Action:

19.12.2015 - 18.12.2019

The project commenced on 19 December 2015. The inception period was finalized on 1 July 2016. The Action was subject to three addenda. The first Addendum dated 15 December 2017 was for a year project extension with a deadline of Action of 18 December 2018. As the security situation did not allow humanitarian demining in the Van and Hakkari regions, the Project Fiche was revised and a second Addendum was prepared. Second Addendum was signed on 15 August 2018 and exceptionally took effect retroactively as of 28 March 2018. In second Addendum, the clearance areas were changed from Van - Hakkari regions to Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) region. The third Addendum, signed on 18 December 2018, extended the target date of this Action until the 18 December 2019 due to concerns that the timeline stipulated in the Action would not provide the time necessary to maximize the clearances due to topography, weather, and minefield conditions as well as a high turnover of management and delays in clearance contractor's ability to mobilize.

## 1.7. Target country(ies) or region(s):

Turkey, Eastern Border Regions of Turkey including Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) province

# 1.8. Final beneficiaries and target groups<sup>1</sup>:

Local population: All persons impacted by the presence of landmines on the Eastern Borders of Turkey, including the civilian population, security forces and government personnel engaged in Integrated Border Management (IBM) activities. The target groups are the Ministry of National Defence (Turkish Mine Action Centre-TURMAC), the Turkish General Staff (Land Forces Command), and the Ministry of Interior

June 2020 Page 6 of 3

<sup>&</sup>quot;Target groups" are the groups/entities who are directly positively affected by the Project at the Project Purpose level, and "Final beneficiaries" are those who benefited from the Project in the long term at the level of the society or sector at large.

(General Directorate of Provincial Administrations, Border Management, Foreign Affairs and Projects Department).

1.9. Country(ies) in which the activities take place (if different from 1.7):

Not applicable.

June 2020
Page 7 of 31
Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the

#### 2. ASSESSMENT OF IMPLEMENTATION OF ACTIVITIES OF THE ACTION

#### 2.1. Results and Activities.

The Logical Framework of the Action with the results detailed below is listed at Annex

## 2.1.1. Result 1: Demining the border regions of Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) is completed

## **Activity 1.1: Survey of mined areas**

The original target of the Action was clearance of minefields (4,309,889 m<sup>2</sup> area) in the border regions of Van-Hakkari and following the handover of mined areas to government authorities, the border areas would be made available for humanitarian border surveillance systems. However, based on the results of the non-technical survey, the clearance target was changed to Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) (1.2 million m<sup>2</sup> area).

The non-technical survey was conducted between 16 August and 12 October 2016. The activity was conducted in compliance with the TURMAC minefield schedule listings of all the recorded minefields and suspected hazardous areas for this part of Turkey. The survey was conducted by a UNDP team consisting of an International Demining Expert and a Local Demining Expert. The survey team was permitted by military authorities to carry out non-technical survey only on seven minefields. Due to the security situation, the remainder of the minefields (160) were subjected to a desktop review in conjunction with the military authorities responsible for the operational area.

The results of the non-technical survey were presented in the Steering Committee Preparation Meeting held on 5 October 2016 and in the Steering Committee Meeting held on 17 October 2016. The survey found that (i) security in southern Van and Hakkari would not allow humanitarian mine clearance, and (ii) a full non-technical and partial technical survey would be required before any mine clearance project could be initiated. The full non-technical survey report has been provided in Annex A.

The survey results have been instrumental in redesigning of the project. The UNDP Technical Assistance Team (TAT) worked closely with TURMAC for redesigning the targets and in consultation with key stakeholders it was agreed to re-scope the clearance area to be a continuation of the Phase-I clearance area from north to south of Iğdır covering minimum 1.2 million m<sup>2</sup> minefields in Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) region at the Iranian border. As Phase-I operations ran concurrently and Phase-I Project Fiche would not be approved due to time limitations, the revision of the Phase-II realized on 15 August 2018 through Addendum-II with retroactive date of 28 March 2018.

Upon the approval of the revisions in Project Fiche and Addendum-II in August 2018, Phase-II clearance area covered the 1.2 million m<sup>2</sup> of minefields in the Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) region. These minefields were contiguous (north to south from Iğdır into Ağrı to ensure coherent clearance of the border) and prioritised by TURMAC and relevant Land Forces Border Regiment units. Moreover, Iğdır

June 2020 Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the and Ağrı are two of the borders in Turkey that are mostly affected by irregular migration flows and cross-border crimes. The redefined areas for clearance were complimentary to the national projects on integrated border management: i) surveillance lighting and camera installation in Iğdır and Ağrı border (236 km); ii) modular wall construction in Iğdır and Ağrı border (144 km).

# **Activity 1.2: Procurement of mine clearance services**

With the change of the clearance target of the Action from Van-Hakkari to Iğdır-Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt), the mine clearance contractor had a valid contract established under Phase-I which was extended to safeguard timely and smooth implementation of demining operations in 2018.

# Activity 1.3: Mobilization, training and accreditation of mine clearance service provider

While the mobilization was completed late in 2018 due to the turnover of management and delays in clearance contractor's ability to mobilize, mobilisation was on schedule for 2019 as planned for start of operations. To obtain mine action accreditation the clearance contractor demonstrated competence to apply the Eastern Border Mine Clearance Standards (EBMCS), and any specific provisions of the EBMCS, including national laws and regulations, and financial and insurance requirements.

In 2018, mobilization commenced on 11 May for 5 Turkish teams. The accreditation and refreshment training were completed on 25 May 2018. The visors for deminers arrived on 19 June 2018 and accreditation completed on 20 June 2018. 6xAzerbaijan National Agency for Mine Action (ANAMA) teams arrived on 27 July 2018. ANAMA teams completed refreshment training in Azerbaijan before this date. Accreditation of 6 ANAMA teams was completed on 2 August 2018.

In 2019, The clearance contractor mobilized in early March 2019 and was reaccredited for the 2019 demining season on 30 March 2019, and remained accredited during the implementation period following the assessment of: (i) Standard Operating Procedures (SOP's) are workable, properly verified and established, (ii) Staff and manning levels meet project expectations, (iii) All equipment is serviceable and verified, (iv) the contractor's support and logistical structure are in place before the commencement of any clearance. See Annex B for 2019 Accreditation document for teams, Mine Detection Dogs (MDDs) and equipment.

#### **Activity 1.4: Clearance of specified mined areas**

The clearance methodology was defined in line with the international and national standards which were also reflected in Standard Operating Procedures of the clearance contractor and in the Operational Demining Procedures established under the Phase-I. See Annex C for the Operational Demining Process.

June 2020
Page 9 of 31
Final Negretics Pages 9 of separate Social appearance Through Demining and Increased Bordon Sympolium of Connective at the

Clearance of specified mined areas conducted between 1 June 2018 and 31 October 2019.

At the end of the Action:

- 1,372,770 (901,850 in 2018 and 470,920 in 2019) square meters of land were released, equalling 114% of the required land release under this Action.
- 19,949 AP (12,630 in 2018 and 7,319 in 2019) mines were destroyed in 37 (27 in 2018 and 10 in 2019) minefields. All released areas were handed over to the Government of Turkey.

# Activity 1.5: Final completion and handover of cleared areas

Based on the lessons-learned from the Phase-I clearance operations, it was agreed with TURMAC that the handover of cleared areas under Phase-II to be conducted after every task completion. 37 minefields were handed over to the Government of Turkey. Post Project Report of clearance contractor and Handover certificates of 37 x Phase II Minefields are attached in Annex D.

#### **Activity 1.6: Demobilisation**

Permanent Demobilization for Phase-II started on 31 October 2019 and successfully completed on 18 December 2019.

# 2.1.2. Result 2: Demined areas are certified in compliance with the international and Turkish mine action standards

#### **Activity 2.1: Procurement of QA/QC services**

The QA/QC contract established under Phase-I has been extended to safeguard timely and smooth implementation of demining operations in 2018 to benefit from the Phase-I experience and lessons-learned as well as to ensure cost and time effectiveness.

#### Activity 2.2: Mobilization and accreditation of QA/QC provider

The QA/QC service provider commenced and completed its mobilization in accordance with the contract. In 2018, the mobilization of QA/QC provider was completed on 11 February 2018 and the accreditation was completed on 08 March 2018 and in 2019 the mobilization of QA/QC provider was completed on 18 March 2019 and the accreditation was completed on 20 March 2019

# Activity 2.3: Accreditation of the mine clearance service provider

In 2018, the accreditation of all assets was completed on 2 August 2018. In 2019, accreditation was completed on 30 March 2019. In 2019, all parties were proactive in accreditation process and the operations started successfully on 01 April 2019.

June 2020
Page 10 of 31

## Activity 2.4: QA/QC of mine clearance operations

QA/QC of mine clearance operations was conducted in line with the agreed Operational Demining Procedures (ODP) under Phase I of the project. At each task site, the QA/QC service provider conducted quality control to provide confidence to the beneficiary that clearance and quality requirements defined in the standards have been met and that cleared land is indeed safe for use. No significant quality incident was recorded during the clearance operations. A Sample of QA Evaluation Monitoring for Demining Operations is enclosed in Annex E.

## Activity 2.5: Final completion and handover of cleared areas

As agreed with TURMAC, the handover of cleared areas under the Action has been conducted after every task completion. In total, 37 minefields were handed over to TURMAC. The Final Reports (for 2018 and 2019) of QA/QC service provider are attached in Annex F and Handover Certificates in Annex D.

# 2.1.3. Result 3: Post Project Review is conducted

## Activity 3.1: Lessons learned log maintained throughout duration of project

The Lessons Learned Log, enclosed in Annex G, includes a comprehensive review of the Action with remedial proposals providing a solid background for any future mine action in Turkey. During the clearance operations, a daily log was also kept electronically by clearance contractor according to the EBMCS in addition to the daily report of the QA/QC service provider and field coordinators.

## Activity 3.2: Post project review workshop conducted

For the Post Project Review (PPR) of the Action both clearance contractor and QA/QC service provider prepared a post project report, an international expert conducted a PPR workshop on 10 December 2018. In addition, three workshops on operational level and national standards were conducted by TAT and TURMAC staff on 16 April 2019 (EBMCS), on 16 October 2019 (EBMCS 19 – Medical Support and Casualty Evacuation) and on 17 December 2019 (Lessons Learnt Meeting). All of these contributed to the PPR of the Action.

The international expert evaluated the Action based on a desk review, key informant interviews with UNDP staff, demining service providers, beneficiaries and key stakeholders and a site visit to the field (camp site, minefields). A workshop with key stakeholders was also held on 10 December 2018 to discuss key findings as well as to obtain feedback and prioritise recommendations. After the preliminary findings were shared with participants, participants were divided into three groups and each group provided with discussion questions related to effectiveness and efficiency, sustainability and capacity building. The results of these discussions were also used to inform the final report.

June 2020 Page 11 of 31 Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the

SOPs, ODP, standards were reviewed by UNDP TAT, TURMAC and the contractors just before operations start every year. The review process was led by the UNDP TAT.

UNDP TAT and TURMAC conducted a Final Lessons Learned meeting on December 17, 2019 in order to discuss the latest findings as lesson learned in 2019.

The minutes of the workshops and the report of the international expert are enclosed in Annex H.

The UNDP Project Lessons Learned Report is attached at Annex G.

## **Activity 3.3: Project closure event**

A project closure event was organized on 19 November 2019 with participation of 144 guests including the Deputy Head of EU Delegation Ms. Eleftheria PERTZINIDOU, Deputy Minister of Foreign Affair Mr. Faruk KAYMAKCI, Deputy Minister of Interior Mr. Muhsin DERE, UNDP Resident Representative a.i. Mr. Claudio TOMASI and other high-level military and civilian officials from other ministries and Delegation of the European Union to Turkey as well as invitees from the defence industry and media.

# 2.1.4. Result 4 - Institutional capacity on border management is enhanced

# Activity 4.1 Capacity development for TURMAC

#### Activity 4.1.1: Needs assessment of the national mine action programme

The capacity development activities for TURMAC has been implemented by Short-Term Experts under the leadership of Capacity Development Specialist. The TAT was engaged with Geneva International Centre for Humanitarian Demining (GICHD) to provide the short-term experts required to deliver the capacity development activities.

GICHD is an international expert organization based in Switzerland that works to eliminate mines, explosive remnants of war and other explosive hazards. Founded in 1999, GICHD has the legal status of an independent, international organization under the statutes of the Swiss Federal Council. By undertaking research, developing standards and disseminating knowledge, GICHD supports capacity development in mine-affected countries. It works with national and local authorities to help them plan, coordinate, implement, monitor and evaluate mine action programs. GICHD also contributes to the implementation of the Anti-Personnel Mine Ban Convention (APMBC), the Convention on Cluster Munitions (CCM) and other relevant instruments of international law.

UNDP approached GICHD to provide capacity development services to complement activities within this project. Specifically, a needs assessment of TURMAC was implemented in accordance with the Grant Contract and Description of the Action to cover all aspects of mine action including advocacy, clearance, risk education, victim assistance and gender. Accordingly, a needs

June 2020 Page 12 of 31 Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the

assessment of the national mine action programme was completed during 17 – 21 October 2016 by GICHD and UNDP Capacity Development Specialist (CDS). Following the needs assessment activity, the CDS conducted a half-day workshop in TURMAC to discuss findings of the assessment. Comments of TURMAC management are incorporated to the consolidated final assessment report.

In addition, the UNDP Regional Specialist in Istanbul was invited to Ankara from 22 to 24 November 2016 to work with the CDS for consolidating three individual assessments (Information Management, Standards and Operations Capacity Assessments) into one. The report was consolidated and highlights key areas for capacity development.

The Capacity Assessment Report, which is shared in Annex I, has been used as a baseline to formulate and deliver training programs on areas of need to support a fully functional National Mine Action Centre. The report provided TURMAC and UNDP with a clearer indication of where focused capacity development is required. See the list of training/courses identified in the assessment report and delivered under activity 4.1.6 below.

## Activity 4.1.2: Review of the national mine action strategy

A Strategic Mine Action Plan of TURMAC 2017-2019 was drafted by TURMAC and sent to the MoND, MoI and Land Forces and other stakeholders in October 2016. The draft strategic plan was shared with the CDS for review and comments. The CDS subsequently conducted a one-day workshop to share comments as well as providing guidance on developing mine action strategy.

In January 2017, the CDS substantially revised the draft plan in close coordination with the management of the TURMAC which was subsequently agreed by the MoND. The revised version has been reviewed and amended by TURMAC in consultation with CDS to ensure comments provided by representatives of the MoND were addressed and imbedded. The three-year plan covering the period of 2020-2022 is in approval process by the Minister of National Defence.

As a follow-up, a national workshop on planning and prioritisation with participation of all stakeholders was conducted in Ankara on 29 and 30 November 2017. In this workshop, in addition to formally introducing the strategy and its objectives to the broader mine action stakeholders in Turkey, matters related to planning and prioritization for the year 2018 were discussed. This was to ensure that the national plan is fully understood and supported by annual activities plan. The workshop report in English and in Turkish is attached in Annex J. [Annex A of Progress Report 2]

A workshop was held on 16 January 2018 where result-based reporting was discussed. The aim of the workshop was (i) to establish a national result-based reporting format for mine action activities; (ii) to measure and consolidate achievements in delivery of mine action operations; and (iii) to consolidate progress in capacity development, management and coordination, information management, quality management and borders management. Through the

June 2020 Page 13 of 31 Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the Eastern Borders of Turkey – Phase II

workshop the Annual Activity Report for 2017 was produced, communication and collaboration with key stakeholders was improved.

The "National Coordination Meeting" was held on 13 March 2018 at which stakeholders were updated on coordination issues and ToRs for further National Coordination Meetings were developed.

# **Activity 4.1.3: Development of national standards**

The CDS was engaged in the development of National Mine Action Standards (NMAS) with TURMAC Quality Management Department on daily basis.

In addition to EBMCS, following the initial training and planning for the development of NMAS, a number of priority NMAS were drafted by TURMAC with support from the TAT. The draft standards were then debated in a threeday national workshop on 24-26 January 2017. The workshop report in English and Turkish is attached in Annex K. [Annex B of the Progress Report 2] TURMAC staff have been fully trained in writing national standards. 44 NMAS have now been developed, debated, reviewed and revised among TURMAC and TAT to regulate mine action in Turkey. A final set of NMAS has been published [https://mafam.msb.gov.tr/MAFAM/icerik/milli-TURMAC's website. mayin-faaliyet-standartlari ]

As NMAS are living documents and need to be revised on regular basis to ensure they are up-to-date and relevant, TAT has supported the establishment a formal National Review Board in 2018 with qualified members to institutionalize, review and revise NMAS. TORs for the review board was developed and delivered in April 2018. NMAS have been periodically reviewed and updated by TURMAC and uploaded to the TURMAC website.

## **Activity 4.1.4: Development of guidelines on Land Release**

A Technical Working Group was established, Terms of References were developed, and the first meeting was held in Iğdır on 11 November 2016 to understand Land Release issues and to develop and implement an effective Land Release policy in Turkey.

A national workshop on humanitarian mine action with a land release focus was conducted for all national mine action stakeholders on 16 and 17 January 2017 in Ankara. The workshop enhanced TURMAC's and stakeholders' knowledge on land release and mine action in general.

In addition, the national workshop on NMAS covered and debated the land release subject which resulted in improving knowledge and understanding of the concept. Several smaller-size meetings/workshops were held to clarify the importance and the need of a land release policy in accordance with the principles of IMAS and the APMBC.

The TAT developed a proposed ODP to be used as the guidelines on land release, which was introduced to TURMAC in January 2017. The ODP was then adopted by the project and agreed by TURMAC on 27 March 2017. The TAT

June 2020 Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the prepared a draft National Land Release Policy in close consultation with TURMAC management which is attached in Annex L. [Annex C of the Progress Report 2].

Other capacity development activities listed under 4.1.6 had directly contributed to land release understanding. Specifically, the Handover of Released Land Workshop on 15 September 2017, the three-week Non-technical Survey Training conducted in September-October 2017 in addition to TURMAC (please see "Applied Non-Technical Survey Training" in Annex N for the related report) and UNDP joint visit to Gaziantep and Izmir, visit to mine action centre of Afghanistan and the Information Management System for Mine Action (IMSMA) training and support provided throughout 2017.

#### **Activity 4.1.5: Review of the mine clearance completion plan**

The TAT supported the participation of TURMAC representatives to the International Meeting on National Mine Action Programme Directors in February 2018.

As per Article 7 of the APMBC state parties are required to provide annual report on progress made with regard to mine clearance in their respective countries. TURMAC with support from the TAT produced and submitted through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) the annual report in April 2019 for the period of 01 January-31 December 2018, in accordance with the requirements of the convention. Turkey's Article 7 report submitted in English attached in Annex M.

#### Activity 4.1.6: Develop and deliver tailored training activities

The Capacity Needs Assessment recommended a number of training courses for TURMAC.

In 2017, 14 different training, courses and workshops were delivered:

- 1. 16-17 January 2017 "Basic Humanitarian Mine Action Course"
- 2. 18-19 January 2017 "Interagency Coordination Workshop"
- 3. 24-26 January 2017 "National Mine Action Standards Workshop"
- 4. 6-10 February 2017 Participated alongside the Turkish/TURMAC delegation in the International Meeting of the National Directors/UN Advisors. (No report)
- 5. 23 February-10 March 2017 "IMSMA A1 Course"
- 6. 20 March-7 April 2017 Two senior managers from TURMAC attended the JMU Senior Managers Course in Croatia TURMAC Director could not attend due to other engagement. (No report)
- 7. 11-13 April 2017 "Legal efficiency/Contract Management Course"
- 8. 10-14 April 2017 Capacity Development Mission to Gaziantep (Syrian Borders) and Izmir (Engineering School)
- 9. 5-10 May 2017 Capacity Development visit to MAPA Kabul, Afghanistan
- 10. 24-28 July 2017 "Applied Quality Management Training Course"
- 11. 15 September 2017 "Handover Workshop"
- 12. 18 September 6 October 2017 "Applied NTS Course"

June 2020
Page 15 of 31

- 13. 29-30 November 2017 "Planning & Prioritization Workshop"
  14. 18-21 December 2017 16<sup>th</sup> Meeting of the States Party to the APMBC in Vienna. (No report)
- For details see attached training and workshop reports in Annex N.

#### In 2018:

- Between 22 January and 2 February 2018, IMSMA issues resolved, data collection forms are finalized.
- Between 5 and 16 February 2018, "IMSMA A1 Users Training Course" was conducted, 15 TURMAC personnel were trained on IMSMA.

As a result of a meeting with TURMAC and MoND in late 2016, TURMAC has agreed to use the IMSMA. IMSMA is a computer-based tool developed by GICHD and it is used by more than 40 mine action programmes around the world. The system helps mine action programmes to collect, process and disseminate mine action information effectively. Following the decision of the MoND for the use of IMSMA, UNDP TAT procured the hardware in January 2017. Installation of hardware with remote support from GICHD occurred in January 2017. IMSMA translation to Turkish (guidelines provided by GICHD) was completed during January-February 2017. An IMSMA A1 certified course was conducted to 10 TURMAC personnel in Ankara by GICHD and UNDP from 23 February to 10 March 2017. See report attached Annex N, Reports under Activity 4.1.6. Following IMSMA A1 course, the TAT provided additional support in the second half of 2017 in the following:

- Finalization of IMSMA installation in Turkish.
- Establishment of a country structure.
- Establishment of the initial mine action data collection reports.
- Establishment and field test of Non-technical survey reports.
- Establishment of necessary process maps and procedures.
- Establishment of a method and provision of training on migration of data and report from the EBMCP.
- Provision of support in creating a secure communication method of data from the field to TURMAC given that data and report is classified as confidential. In addition to the use by the EBMCP, the system was successfully used during the 2019 demining season by the Gendarmerie Demining Team (JOMAT) and Army Demining Team (OMAT) demining teams.

It is to be noted that UNDP delivered beyond what was initially planned under capacity development plan.

# Activity 4.2: Strengthened Risk analysis System on Integrated Border Management

Activity 4.2.1: Review of the legal dimension of border security in the EU

June 2020
Page 16 of 31
Final Negretics Pages 15 or Series according to the Page 16 of 31

The comparative analysis report on the legislative framework of border security (hereinafter - Report) incorporating the comments of the beneficiaries is attached in Annex O.

The Activity was designed to analyse the legislative framework of border security covering also the new member states, discuss new conceptual approaches and tools in border security for integrated border management align with the EU Acquis, including comparative analysis of national regulations concerning inter agency cooperation and coordination as well as legal instruments regulating international cooperation. Considering the Turkish Land Forces as the main target group of the Project, the Report is focused on legal aspects and legal instruments for ensuring efficient border surveillance.

The aim of the analysis was to support development of effective border surveillance of Turkey through assessment of legal aspects of the common EU border surveillance system as well as legal aspects of border surveillance in selected EU Member States, namely Finland, Estonia, Lithuania, Poland, Hungary, Romania and Slovenia.

The Report presents key lessons learned and is intended to provide a better understanding of legal and regulatory framework for the EU external land border surveillance. More specifically, it aims to:

- Raise awareness and render legal advice and assistance to Turkish border practitioners on enhancement of legal and regulatory framework basis for border surveillance:
- Facilitate development of tailor-made training modules on border security for the professional staff at the borders, including Training of Trainers program, in terms of legal aspects.

National solutions have been explored and described in order to provide for examples of good practices. The objective of such approach was to complement the comparative analysis with possible practical solutions how to manage the system in Turkey.

# Activity 4.2.2: Comparative review of risk analysis-based border management

The comparative review of risk analysis-based border management report (hereinafter - Report) incorporating the comments of the beneficiaries is attached in Annex P. [Annex G of the Progress Report 2]

The Activity was designed to analyse a comparative review of risk analysisbased border management covering the EU member states and European Border and Coast Guard Agency (EBCGA) with conceptual and operational aspects. The scope of the analysis is to present current good practices related to function of risk analysis in support to land border surveillance in designated EU member states. The objective is to present the system requirements as set in the EU legislation and documents that are binding to all the EU member states.

June 2020 Page 17 of 31 Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the

Following a desk-review of documents on elaboration of tailor-made risk management model in 2010-2012, as well as other available contextual materials on border management in Turkey, a questionnaire was prepared and sent to the respective EU member states responsible for EU external land border surveillance. Responses were received from Finland, Estonia, Lithuania, Poland, Hungary, Romania and Slovenia. The findings and lessons learned from technical visit to Finland conducted in January 2017 was also utilized in preparation of the Report.

Considering that the Land Forces as the main target group of the Project, the Report is focused on importance of risk analysis serving as one of the main tools for efficient border surveillance. References are made to risk analysis features supporting strategic management and operational and tactical field work in border surveillance. The Report aims to:

- Support further work on updating and development of the tailor-made risk analysis model for border management in Turkey;
- Facilitate development of tailor-made training modules on risk analysisbased border management for the professional staff at the borders, including Training of Trainers program in terms of sustainability.

The Report also supports further enhancement of analytical capacities of Land Forces staff in border management at all levels of command.

# Activity 4.2.3: Develop updated risk management model for border management

The updated tailor-made risk management model for border management in Turkey report (hereinafter – Report) incorporating the comments of the beneficiaries is attached in Annex Q.

The aim of this Activity was to update the "Tailor Made Risk Management Model within Turkish Integrated Border Management" elaborated as one of the results of the EU Twinning project completed in 2012. The model was elaborated in close cooperation with all Turkish authorities involved in border control and tailored according to the officially approved proposals by all Turkish stakeholders and EU experts. Considering the Land Forces as the main target group of the Project, the Report focuses more deeply on land border surveillance and only referring to other borders.

Updating of the Model aims to specify the tailored working process, interaction and cooperation between the authorities in charge of border security in Turkey in order to produce in the systematic way relevant risk analysis to support their border related tasks. The updated model also focuses on further development of risk analysis capacities for border surveillance.

The starting point for the work was to start processing the activities which are more likely to be feasible especially in terms of existing legislation and division of the duties of the authorities concerned as well as taking into account the administrative division and public administration system in Turkey. For this

**June 2020**Page 18 of 31
Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the

purpose, a questionnaire was prepared for the Ministry of Interior, Land Forces Command, General Command of Gendarmerie, Turkish National Police, Directorate General of Migration Management and Ministry of Customs and Trade. The questionnaire focused on clarifying the existing risk management system and information collection arrangements within the agencies as well as inter-agency cooperation and reporting system. The purpose was to identify the progress, obstacles in cooperation, problem areas, needs and priorities of each agency in application of risk analysis for border surveillance. Land Forces Command responded to the questionnaire with written answers, the others presented the issue during the two-day workshop conducted in May 2017. A series of individual expert interviews was completed also with UNDP, Land Forces command, International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD), International Organization for Migration (IOM) and other entities. During these interviews it appeared that involving of the Ministry of Interior, General Directorate of Security, General Command of Gendarmerie and Directorate of Migration as well as Ministry of Customs and Trade are vital in terms of achieving appropriate results. The Ministry of Interior accepted this kind of wider approach. At the same time, it was agreed that the updated model should focus on land borders and preferably starting from the most feasible part, i.e. from province (operational/tactical) level in parallel with the development process of the National Coordination and Joint Risk Analysis Centre (NACORAC). Consequently, the Model was updated and adjusted fitting to the current situation focusing on land borders and especially to the operational and tactical level risk analysis within province level.

# Activity 4.2.4: Comparative analysis of procedural requirements addressing illegal movements at the border regions

The comparative analysis report on procedural requirements addressing illegal movements at the border regions report (hereinafter – Report) incorporating the comments of the beneficiaries is attached in Annex R.

The Activity was designed to analyse all procedural steps from following up the illegal movements to their delivery to the internal security forces as well as a gap analysis of the applied procedures in the country. Considering Land Forces as the main target group of the Project, the Report is focused on procedural requirement that are especially important for ensuring efficient border surveillance.

The analysis aimed to support development of effective border surveillance of Turkey through comparative assessment of procedural requirements and practices applied by Turkey and the Member States at the EU external land borders. The analysis also aimed at identification of needs for improvement of the applied procedures in the country and providing recommendation on best applicable practices. More specifically, the Report also aims to:

- Raise awareness and render advice and assistance to Turkish border practitioners on best practices on tackling, handling and preventing illegal movement in border areas;

June 2020

Page 19 of 31

Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the

- Facilitate development of tailor-made training modules on respective topics for the professional staff at the borders, including Training of Trainers program.
- Comparative analysis report on the legislative framework of border security (produced under Activity 4.2.1 of the Project) provides fundamentals of interaction and co-operation of border surveillance authorities with police, customs, and cross-border crime investigation authorities in the EU countries. This output was used for guidance in comparative analysis of respective procedural requirements in EU Member States and Turkey.

The comparative analysis was based on the desk review of respective Turkish legal acts, EU documents, the feedback from the Land Forces Command, responses to questionnaire received from selected EU countries (Finland, Estonia, Lithuania, Poland, Hungary, Romania and Slovenia) and other sources. Capabilities to address illegal movements at the border regions are determined using two key parameters of border surveillance which are situational awareness and reaction capability.

# Activity 4.2.5: Development and delivery of tailor-made training modules for the professional staff at borders

The tailor-made training modules were delivered to 262 professional staff working in the Eastern border region of the country. The contents of training modules were designed on the basis of finding, conclusions and recommendation from Project Activities 4.2.1 to 4.2.4 and the beneficiaries' proposals on the issues of risk analysis-based border management and the procedural approaches addressing illegal movements of interest. Training modules covered the notion of risk analysis-based border management and the procedural requirements addressing illegal movements. Training materials were translated into Turkish and presented to the Ministry of Interior and Land Forces Command.

The report of the four training programmes which were outlined and agreed by the Education and Doctrine Command is attached in Annex S. [Annex J of the Progress Report 2]

# Activity 4.2.6: Development and delivery of Training of Trainers (ToT) programme

Following the training programs which were designed and delivered under the Activity 4.2.5 to 262 professional staff, a two-day ToT for the selected key 75 professionals was organized aiming to create a pool of experts among professionals at Eastern borders of Turkey and capacitate them on risk analysis based border management and the procedural requirements.

June 2020 Page 20 of 31

#### 2.2. Assessment of Results

The overall objective of the Project is to contribute to social and economic development through demining and increased border security in Eastern Turkey. The specific objective of the project is to contribute to the prevention of illegal migration and all types of cross-border crimes at Turkey's Eastern borders in line with EU's IBM policies and strategies via de-mining the area and providing effective and humanitarian border management through a technologically supported modern border surveillance system.

The Action is a vital component of the Government of Turkey's strategy to enhance their border security and the Government is committed to clear all anti-personnel mines as required by the Ottawa Convention. The demining of land along the Iranian border is an integral component of the Action that establishes modern border management practices which will enable Turkey to respond to the challenges that include unauthorised migration, terrorism, people trafficking and smuggling. Strengthening border management, which is indispensable component of a comprehensive IBM Programme of EU, is a major political, economic and social issue in Turkey and the stakeholders are highly engaged in the project and committed to its success. The rapid establishment and support for the TURMAC is an indicator of this commitment.

The Action had four components: (i) Demining the border regions of Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) is completed, (ii) Demined areas are certified in compliance with the international and Turkish mine action standards, (iii) Post project review is conducted and (iv) Institutional capacity on border management is enhanced.

The project commenced on 19 December 2015 and the inception period was finalized on 1 July 2016. Without the benefit of a pilot phase/project and non-technical/technical survey before the start of the intensive clearances of this Action, all parties involved faced unforeseen challenges with unachievable clearance targets which required a substantial change in the logical framework of the Action with regards to the demining operations. The lessons-learned accumulated under the Phase-I operations were critical in redesigning of the Action.

The Action was subject to three addenda:

(i) The first Addendum dated on 15 December 2017 was for a year project extension, including new capacity development activities for TURMAC with a deadline of Action of 18 December 2018.

**June 2020** Page 21 of 31

- The Phase-II minefield survey, which was conducted by a group of (ii) UNDP experts, including an international and local expert accompanied by TURMAC found that (1) current security in southern Van and Hakkari would not allow humanitarian mine clearance, and (2) a full non-technical and partial technical survey would be required before any mine clearance project could be let. In addition, the results of the joint site-reconnaissance, which was conducted in August 2016 in Phase I Project areas (Iğdır, Kars, Ağrı, Van) showed that the difficulties involved in identifying mine lines and accessing and physically clearing many of the minefields were critically underestimated during the pre-contracting phase due to the lack a comprehensive technical survey. Based on the above facts and lessons learned in Phase-I operations, it was agreed during the 28 February 2017 Steering Committee meeting that the Phase-II mine clearance areas were redefined to cover the areas that were not covered in Phase-I project i.e. from Hakkari and Van regions to Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) region. This required amendment documents reflecting the changes for both Phases which were submitted to CFCU and Delegation of the European Union to Turkey (EUD) in May 2017.
- At the Steering Committee meeting on 27 October 2017, all parties (iii) acknowledged the shared responsibility for the development of initial clearance targets and the need to redesign targets. Also, at the same Steering Committee meeting, EUD informed that the Project Fiche submitted to modify Phase-I would not be approved due to time limitations and not because it was considered unnecessary. Phase-II Project Fiche would be accepted as non-substantial process which would require less time for approval. However, Brussels suspended the Phase-II Project Fiche process as clearance in Ağrı, which was originally covered under Phase I was suggested to be shifted to Phase-II and this was considered an overlap and duplication in clearance targets of both Phases. EUD clarified that this resulted from the fact that both Project Fiche modifications were not evaluated all together in Brussels due to procedural differences. Therefore, the clearance area of the Action was changed from Hakkari and Van regions (4,309,889 m<sup>2</sup> area) to Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) region (minimum 1.2 million m<sup>2</sup> area) through the revisions in Project Fiche and Addendum-II which was approved on 18 July 2018 but exceptionally took effect retroactively as of 28 March 2018.
- (iv) The third Addendum, signed on 18 December 2018, extended the target date of this Action until 18 December 2019 due to concerns that the timeline stipulated in the Action would not provide the time necessary to maximize the clearances due to topography, weather, and minefield conditions as well as a high turnover of management and delays in the clearance contractor's ability to mobilize.

The demining operations started with the mobilization and accreditation of the QA/QC provider which was completed on 11 February 2018. Following the mobilization, refreshment training for deminers and accreditation of the teams, the clearance operations started on 1 June 2018. The clearance operations were conducted according to the Eastern Border Mine Clearance Standards and the Operational Demining Process established under the Phase-I project.

Page 22 of 31
Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the

At the end of two demining seasons), 37 minefields were handed over, 1,372,770 m<sup>2</sup>land was released (114% of the required land) and 19,949 anti-personnel mines were found and destroyed. The QA/QC of demining operations was ensured through the inspection and monitoring of the clearance contractor's activities including mine action operational methods (MDDs, manual clearance teams and/or mechanical) by the QA/QC service provider. The area released was certified according to international and national standards and handed over to the Turkish authorities. During this Action, there was one critical incident in which a deminer sustained serious injury.

The most significant risk to the demining element of the Action was the security situation in the areas of operations. The security situation resulted in the cancellation of projected demining in the Van-Hakkari region. The security situation was monitored throughout the implementation period and coordinated with relevant authorities. The effective coordination activities of TAT Field Coordinators in close cooperation with TURMAC and 5<sup>th</sup> Border Regiment kept the potential impact of the security situation at minimum.

All activities under the institutional capacity on border management and the capacity development for TURMAC components were successfully conducted. The capacity of TURMAC was enhanced through activities and trainings that were developed in consultation with TURMAC to ensure that TURMAC personnel were well equipped with the relevant skills on mine action. TURMAC was reorganized and adopted an appropriate structure which included departments of operations, survey, strategy, information and quality management. Further information has been provided in the rest of the report.

Regarding the capacity development component of the Action, the turnover of qualified management staff of TURMAC due to military regulation remained a major risk for the establishment of good national capacity in Turkey. The majority of trained and qualified military staff in TURMAC were subject to assignment rotation. To mitigate these risks, TURMAC advised to employ staff for a longer duration particularly in the technical and operational positions.

Post project review was conducted to identify the lessons-learned which are relevant to the planning, preparation and clearance phases of the operation. Further information has been provided in this report and attachments.

UNDP and main beneficiaries worked in close cooperation for the realization of this Action. The capacity development activities immensely contributed to the improvement of TURMAC's capacity despite the high turnover of staff. UNDP and TURMAC had a very collaborative approach and based on the lessons-learned of both Phase-I and II developed the Phase-III of the Action to continue demining along the Iranian border in Ardahan, Kars, Iğdır and Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) region in line with the Government of Turkey's priorities to establish integrated border management system. Phase-III also includes a national non-technical survey of all minefields in the border regions of Turkey to allow for Turkey (with 354 minefields in the Mardin Province to be completed by TURMAC) to provide the best quantitative assessment for future demining activities in support of the sustainability of mine action in Turkey and fulfilment of Turkey's obligations under the Anti-Personnel Mine Ban Convention, and a Mine Risk Education component to build the capacity of a risk education civil society organisation and delivery risk education and awareness to priority communities. The Non-Technical Survey will provide recommendations for further technical survey and clearance activities, including, where appropriate, details of recommended asset types and methodologies for further interventions.

June 2020
Page 23 of 31
Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the
Eastern Borders of Turkey – Phase II

# 2.3. Contracts (other than mine clearance and QA/QC service provider contracts)

# 2.3.1. Senior/Junior International/Local Short-Term Experts

Senior International short-term experts were mobilized for the following consultancy services:

Result 1: Demining the border regions	
of Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) is completed	105 days
Activity 1.1: Survey of mined areas	
Activity 1.2: Procurement of mine	
clearance service	
Activity 1.3: Mobilization, training	
and accreditation of mine clearance	
service provider	
Activity 1.4: Clearance of	
specified mined areas	
Activity 1.5: Final completion and	
handover of cleared areas	
Activity 1.6: Demobilisation	
Result 2: Demined areas are certified in	
compliance with the international and	110 days
Turkish mine action standards	,
Activity 2.1: Procurement of	
QA/QC services	
Activity 2.2: Mobilization and	
accreditation of QA/QC provider	
Activity 2.3: Accreditation of the	
mine clearance service provider	
Activity 2.4: QA/QC of mine	
clearance operations	
Activity 2.5: Final completion and	
handover of cleared areas	
Result 3: Post Project Review is	
conducted	20 days
Activity 3.2: Post project review	
workshop conducted	
Result 4 - Institutional capacity on	
border management is enhanced	159 days
Activity 4.1.1: Needs assessment	155 days
of the national mine action	
programme	
Activity 4.1.2: Review of the	
national mine action strategy	
Activity 4.1.3: Development of	
national standards	
Activity 4.1.4: Development of	
guidelines on Land Release	
guidennes on Land Release	

June 2020 Page 24 of 31 Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the Eastern Borders of Turkey – Phase II

Junior National Short-term experts were mobilized for following consultancy services:

<b>Result 1: Demining the border regions</b>	
of Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) is completed	54 days
Activity 1.1: Survey of mined	
areas	
TOTAL	54 days

## 2.3.2. Long-Term Agreements

Travel and event management and printing services were procured through UNDP's corporate Long-Term Agreement with SERENAS.

# 2.4. Sustainability

The Action ran concurrently with the Phase-I project. While the capacity development work undertaken in Phase II supported activities within Phase-I, the data collected and lessons-learned of Phase-I activities, the Operational Demining Process developed under Phase-I supported a better understanding of the clearance requirements to be undertaken under Phase II and had two revisions (1st Revision 31 March 2018 and 2nd Revision 21 March 2019). This synergy helped to development of the TURMAC and support future mine action programming.

June 2020

Page 25 of 31

Final Narrative Report: Socio-economic Development Through Demining and Increased Border Surveillance Capacity at the

TAT had working group meetings with TURMAC on sustainability of the Action and developed a Phase-III project which includes non-technical survey of all minefields in Turkey (with 354 minefields in the Mardin Province to be completed by TURMAC) and continuation of demining along the eastern borders in line with the Government of Turkey's priorities to establish integrated border management system.

With regards to demining, at the end of the Action, the areas cleared no longer pose a safety concern to military and civilian personnel in the area. The clearance of minefields allows for unimpeded and secure approach to the border fence, enabling a broader range of humanitarian-based border surveillance to occur.

June 2020 Page 26 of 31

## 2.5. Monitoring and Evaluation

The project was monitored on a daily basis by UNDP. Fourteen Steering Committee Meetings and several technical consultation meetings were held. These meetings were also used as a monitoring mechanism. At the field, Weekly Field Coordination Meetings (WFCM) were held every week on issues related to administrative, safety and security of operations. Furthermore, the Operational Working Group (OWG) convened periodically to review and assess the operations and to make operational decisions. During the implementation period, 26 OWG meetings were held with participation of representatives from TURMAC, 5<sup>th</sup> Border Regiment Units, UNDP-TAT, clearance and QA/QC contractors. In addition, an independent expert evaluated the project and prepared the Post Project Review Report and an independent outcome evaluation was conducted. External monitoring and evaluation were also conducted through CFCU, Ministry of European Union Affairs and UNDP's audit process.

## 2.6. Logical Framework

The logical framework changed with regards to the demining operations component that no clearance was conducted in Hakkari and Van due to local security conditions. TAT worked closely with TURMAC in redesigning of the Action to reflect the outputs of survey of minefields conducted between 16 August and 12 October 2016 (see Activity 1.1.). It was agreed to re-scope the clearance area and upon the approval of the revisions in Project Fiche and Addendum-II in 2018, the Phase-II clearance area covered the minefields in Ağrı (Doğubeyazıt) region, which were contiguous (north to south, from Iğdır into Ağrı). The final Logical Framework is attached at Annex V.

#### 2.7. Action Plan

The Action Plan updated as per the realization of the activities is available in Annex X.

## 2.8. Budget

Final Budget Report of the Action as at 18 December 2019 is enclosed in Annex T covering the whole implementation period of the Grant Agreement.

The following traches were received in the scope of the Action:

Amount	Receipt Date
€ 6,197,704.41	23.01.2016
€ 5,987,123.12	17.01.2019

In line with the presented final budget report and as per UNDP accounts, remaining funds to be returned to the Contracting Authority is EUR 294,580.30.

Upon approval of the final report, the remaining funds will be returned in accordance with the UNORE in force during the month of transfer of this surplus.

June 2020 Page 27 of 31

#### 3. PARTNERS AND COOPERATION

#### 3.1. Relations with the Beneficiaries

UNDP and main beneficiaries worked in close cooperation for the realization of this Action. After the establishment of the TURMAC under the Law No. 6586 in 2015, UNDP has supported TURMAC in development of the national standards, the introduction of IMSMA, the mentoring and building an understanding of the policies, processes and international best practices of humanitarian mine action. The capacity development activities conducted under this Action has immensely contributed to the improvement of TURMAC's capacity despite the high turnover of military staff.

## 3.2. Continuation of Partnership

The partnership between UNDP, TURMAC MoND and MoI continues in 2020 within the scope of the Phase III project which will include demining in the eastern borders and Non-Technical Survey of mined areas in Turkey as well as capacity building on mine risk education. The Phase III will support the Government of Turkey in its mission to meets its obligations under the APMBC and its possible request for an extension. As per the Steering Committee decision made in the 13<sup>th</sup> Steering Committee Meeting held on 5 November 2019, it was decided that assets and equipment procured in the scope of the project would be kept by UNDP and transferred to Phase III project. Please see Annex W - 13<sup>th</sup> Steering Committee Meeting Minutes and Transfer of Title of Assets Document with attached Transferred Asset List for details.

#### 3.3. Relations with other Government Authorities

The local authorities in Iğdır, particularly the Governorate and District Governorate Offices contributed to implementation of the field activities by ensuring coordination with other local authorities when required.

In addition, Iğdır Directorate General of Migration Management worked in close coordination with UNDP and the contractors in order to provide timely work and stay in Turkey for the foreign staff of contractors.

## 3.4. Relations with other Organizations/Contractors

As part of a greater understanding of the humanitarian demining sector, the TAT supported informal technical coordination and relationship building between TURMAC and international organisations involved with mine action, including the Geneva International Centre for Humanitarian Demining, UNDP Regional Mine Action Advisors, and the United Nations Mine Action Service. Under Capacity Development Component; UNDP had an agreement with GICHD to provide capacity development services to complement activities within the Action.

Professional partnership with both demining contractors was established and maintained throughout the Action.

## 3.5. Links and synergies with other Actions

The Action complemented the UNDP efforts in the region for socio-economic development, fully in line with the proposed United Nations Development Cooperation Strategy Turkey 2016-2020.

**June 2020** Page 28 of 31

Under Risk Analysis on Integrated Border Management, the Action improved institutional capacities of border agencies which contributed to the security in the frontier areas and safety of inhabitants.

Activities aimed at updating risk analysis model created an added value to the previous EU projects in this area and synergies with efforts on development of NACORAC as top focal point in Turkish Integrated Border Management.

The deliverables focusing on border units of Land Forces Command were in line with IOM, ICMPD, EBCGA and other international inputs on improving migration and border management in Turkey.

The Action paved way for implementation of two new projects on IBM. The "Increasing Border Surveillance Capacity of Borders Between Turkey and Greece Project Phase-I" was implemented between June 2017 and February 2019 and "Phase-II is being implemented between December 2018 and June 2020.

The experience and results achieved under this Action, particularly related to the demining contributed to the design of Phase-III.

# 3.6. Links with previous EU Grants

This is the second EC funded project in the field of mine clearance implemented by the UNDP in Turkey. The Phase-I of this project was implemented between 29 May 2015 and 15 December 2017. In addition, a nine-month "Preparatory Work for the Demining of the Eastern Borders of Turkey" was initiated with support of EU covering the period between 15 August 2014 and 15 May 2015 with overall objective of designing Phase-I and Phase-II.

## 3.7. Cooperation with the Contracting Authority

The Contracting Authority (CFCU) was very committed to help the implementation go very smoothly. CFCU kindly responded promptly to all the queries and questions of the UNDP. Their guidance played an important role in achievement of all the results of the Action.

**June 2020** Page 29 of 31

#### 4. VISIBILITY

The visibility of the Action carried utmost importance for the Government of Turkey, UNDP and the European Commission. To ensure the visibility of the EU contribution in this Action, the "Joint Visibility Guidelines for EC-UN Actions in the Field" was applied to all visibility materials. The posters, brochures, banners, notebooks, pens, invitations, USB sticks, etc. were prepared; made use of in the workshops, 4<sup>th</sup> April International Mine Awareness, Mine Action Day and Closure Event; and disseminated to the local authorities through the TURMAC. The materials were well designed and approved by TURMAC. The visibility of the Action was also ensured at the local level via placing banners and labels at the camp area.

4<sup>th</sup> of April, the UN's International Day for Mine Awareness and Assistance in Mine Action served as a meaningful platform to raise awareness on mine action in Turkey and disseminate the results of the Action. TURMAC and UNDP with support of the EU organized two events on 4 April in 2018 and 2019. Both events had extensive coverage in national newsletters and web sites.

As defined in the Description of Action, UNDP, working closely with TURMAC, produced a video "Danger Mines" in December 2018. The video captured the results achieved during the lifetime of the Action, explained humanitarian demining operations to build confidence on land release and focused on promoting the clearance of landmines on Turkish borders in line with its commitment to the Mine Ban Treaty. The video was premiered on 4<sup>th</sup> April International Day for Mine Awareness and Assistance in Mine Action in 2019, circulated to 1,457 press contacts, featured on more than 110 media outlets and placed on UNDP website and sent to two international competitions. The video was viewed 2,457 times on YouTube and 16,667 times on Facebook as of 11 June 2020.

Moreover, UNDP produced two human stories: In its "5 out of Five" campaign for the International Women's Day in 2018, Mrs. Sevda Çanak, a paramedic in the demining fields in Iğdır, shared her experience and how she was socially and economically empowered through her role in the demining project. Mrs. Çanak's video was viewed 2,271 times on YouTube (https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Dq9H7JFJ4ug). The second campaign featured a local from Aralık district of Iğdır province Mr. Kaffar Akka who first started as deminer and then became a team leader. He told how his life had changed through this project that he reached a level of better supporting his family through working for this project and others in neighbouring countries during the winter stand down period. Mr. Akka's video was viewed 195 times YouTube on (https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6cIG085U5bo).

The visibility and communication activities conducted during the project closure event were very successful. The social media campaign reached out to 5271 people.

Samples of some visibility materials produced are attached in Annex U. EU cooperation logos placed on the equipment/items currently inaccessible will be strengthened when accessible as such equipment will be used in the scope of Phase III of the project.

**June 2020** Page 30 of 31

## **END**

Name of the contact person for the Action: Mr Claudio Tomasi

Signature: Location: Ankara

Date report due: 18 June 2020 Date report sent: 15 June 2020